

STATE OF MICHIGAN

BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

* * * * *

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
to open a docket to implement the provisions of)
Section 6w of 2016 PA 341 for) Case No. U-18239
CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY'S)
service territory.)
_____)

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
to open a docket to implement the provisions of) Case No. U-18248
Section 6w of 2016 PA 341 for)
DTE ELECTRIC COMPANY'S service territory.)
_____)

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
to open a docket to implement the provisions of) Case No. U-18253
Section 6w of 2016 PA 341 for)
UPPER MICHIGAN ENERGY RESOURCES)
CORPORATION'S service territory.)
_____)

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
to open a docket to implement the provisions of) Case No. U-18254
Section 6w of 2016 PA 341 for)
UPPER PENINSULA POWER COMPANY'S)
service territory.)
_____)

In the matter, on the Commission's own motion,)
to open a docket to implement the provisions of) Case No. U-18258
Section 6w of 2016 PA 341 for)
CLOVERLAND ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE'S)
service territory.)
_____)

At the February 28, 2017 meeting of the Michigan Public Service Commission in Lansing, Michigan.

PRESENT: Hon. Sally A. Talberg, Chairman
Hon. Norman J. Saari, Commissioner
Hon. Rachael A. Eubanks, Commissioner

ORDER CONCERNING IMPLEMENTATION OF SECTION 6W OF ACT 341 OF 2016

In separate orders issued on January 20, 2017, in Case Nos. U-18239 and U-18248 for Consumers Energy Company (Consumers) and DTE Electric Company (DTE Electric), respectively, (the January 20 orders) the Commission commenced proceedings for those utilities to implement a solution to the issue of a potential future electric resource adequacy shortfall in their service territories.¹ As a result of a regulatory proceeding then pending before the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) and recent legislative changes approved by Michigan's Legislature,² three alternative solutions to long-term resource adequacy concerns facing the state of Michigan and the customers of Consumers and DTE Electric, including those served by alternative electric suppliers (AESs), appeared to be possible.³ The three alternative solutions are set forth in Section 6w(1) and 6w(2) of Act 341, and are as follows: (1) a three-year Forward Resource Auction (FRA) embodied within the Competitive Retail Solution (CRS) application filed

¹ See, the discussions regarding this state's long-term resource adequacy concerns contained in the January 20 orders and in the July 22, 2016 order in Case No. U-17992.

² See, Section 6w of 2016 PA 341 (Act 341).

³ The Commission noted that unanticipated resource adequacy shortfalls experienced by investor-owned utilities were not the sole source for concern. Indeed, the Commission has previously expressed a need to ensure that all load serving entities (LSEs), including AESs, would contribute to solving the long-term capacity needs of this state. See, the December 4, 2014 order in Case No. U-17523 and the July 23, 2015 order in Case No. U-17751.

on November 1, 2016 by the Midcontinent Independent System Operator, Inc. (MISO), that was contingent upon approval by the FERC; (2) a Prevailing State Compensation Mechanism (PSCM) that also required FERC approval; and (3) a State Reliability Mechanism (SRM).

On February 2, 2017, the FERC issued an order (the February 2 order) rejecting MISO's CRS tariff filing in Docket No. ER17-284-000. The FERC determined that the FRA proposed by MISO, which would apply to a small amount of load within MISO and would occur more than three years prior to MISO's existing Planning Resource Auction (PRA), would bifurcate the MISO capacity market. According to the FERC, "this bifurcated approach could have uncertain, and potentially adverse, impacts on price formation in both the [FRA] and the [PRA]." February 2, 2017 order, Docket No. ER17-284-000, p. 2. The FERC opined that such a bifurcated market could have a high potential for volatility and might not efficiently clear prices. The FERC stressed that no other FERC-jurisdictional wholesale capacity market clears capacity through use of two distinct market clearing mechanisms held at different points in time, adding that "[m]arket-wide clearing processes are typically more efficient than bifurcated clearing processes." February 2, 2017 order, Docket No. ER17-284-000, p. 3. The FERC also found that MISO had failed to completely explain how transmission constraints would be handled between the FRA and the PRA. February 2, 2017 order, Docket No. ER17-284-000, p. 4. The FERC did not expressly comment on the PSCM proposal that was set forth in MISO'S CRS filing. Notwithstanding, the Commission understands that the PSCM was also rejected in the February 2 order.

Given that the FERC has denied MISO's November 1, 2016 application, the scope of the proceedings and the schedules established by the January 20 orders applicable to Consumers and DTE Electric need to be revised. Specifically, because of the FERC's February 2 order, any further efforts by the Commission to implement Section 6w(1) of Act 341 may no longer be

required. Because the FERC rejected MISO's proposed CRS tariff, the Commission seeks input on whether Consumers and DTE Electric should be relieved of the requirement that the applications to be filed by these utilities in Case Nos. U-18239 and U-18248 include testimony and exhibits regarding "[w]hether the capacity mechanisms described in Sections 6w(1) and (2) of Act 341 are more cost-effective, reasonable, and prudent than MISO's FRA." January 20 orders, p. 6. If the scope of these proceedings were limited in this manner, the focus of these proceedings would be solely on the requirements of Section 6w(2) of Act 341, which provides:

If the appropriate independent system operator receives approval from the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission to implement a resource adequacy tariff that provides for a capacity forward auction, and does not include the option for a state to implement a prevailing state compensation mechanism for capacity, then the commission shall examine whether a state reliability mechanism established under subsection (8) would be more cost-effective, reasonable, and prudent than the capacity forward auction for this state before the commission may order the state reliability mechanism to be implemented in any utility service territory. Before the commission orders the implementation of the state reliability mechanism in 1 or more utility service territories, the commission shall hold a contested case hearing pursuant to chapter 4 of the administrative procedures act of 1969, 1969 PA 306, MCL 24.271 to 24.287. The commission shall allow intervention by interested persons, alternative electric suppliers, and customers of alternative electric suppliers and the utility under consideration. At the conclusion of the proceeding, the commission shall make a finding for each utility service territory under consideration, based on clear and convincing evidence, as to whether or not the state reliability mechanism would be more cost-effective, reasonable, and prudent than the use of the capacity forward auction for this state in meeting the local clearing requirement and the planning reserve margin requirement. The contested case must be scheduled for completion by December 1 before the independent system operator's capacity forward auction for this state, and the commission's decision shall identify which utility service territories will be subject to the state reliability mechanism. If, by September 30, 2017, the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission does not put into effect a resource adequacy tariff that includes a capacity forward auction or a prevailing state compensation mechanism, then the commission shall establish a state reliability mechanism under subsection (8). The commission may commence a proceeding before October 1 if the commission believes orderly administration would be enabled by doing so. If the commission implements a state reliability mechanism, it shall be for a minimum of 4 consecutive planning years beginning in the upcoming planning year. A state reliability charge must be established in the same manner as a capacity charge under subsection (3) and be determined consistent with subsection (8). (Emphasis added).

Additionally, until the Commission is able to assess the implications of the FERC's February 2 order and whether the auction and/or the PSCM are still viable, the Commission finds that the

schedules set in the January 20 orders for Consumers and DTE Electric should be temporarily suspended. Originally, the January 20 orders required Consumers and DTE Electric to file applications in their respective dockets on March 3, 2017. Today's order relieves Consumers and DTE Electric of having to file applications on March 3, 2017, cancels the filing deadline for petitions to intervene that was scheduled for March 10, 2017, and also cancels the separate prehearing conferences for Consumers and DTE Electric scheduled for March 16, 2017. Once the Commission has had a chance to further evaluate the implications from the FERC's February 2 order, the Commission intends to issue another scheduling order for all of the captioned proceedings.

Unlike the January 20 orders, this order contains captions for Upper Michigan Energy Resources Corporation (UMERC), Upper Peninsula Power Company (UPPCo), and Cloverland Electric Cooperative (Cloverland), each of which currently serves or has choice customers enrolled for service. Case No. U-18253 is being opened for UMEREC. Case No. U-18254 is being opened for UPPCo. And, Case No. U-18258 is being opened for Cloverland. The January 20 orders did not apply to UMEREC, UPPCo, or Cloverland because the application filed in Docket No. ER17-284-000 by MISO for approval of its CRS included provisions that would have exempted the choice loads of the utilities serving customers in Michigan's Upper Peninsula because those loads did not meet MISO's materiality threshold. However, nothing in Section 6w(2) of Act 341 excludes any AES loads in Michigan from operation of the SRM. Accordingly, the Commission seeks comment on whether to move forward at this time to establish an SRM for these utilities.

The Commission has opted to briefly refrain from re-scheduling the proceedings for Consumers and DTE Electric or establishing schedules for the proceedings applicable to UMEREC,

UPPCo, and Cloverland in order to allow a limited opportunity for the Commission Staff (Staff), the affected utilities, and other interested persons to comment on the scope of these proceedings and the associated schedules in light of the FERC's decision and the potential shift in the focus away from Section 6w(1) towards Section 6w(2) of Act 341. Toward this end, the Commission will entertain comments filed in these dockets by the Staff, the affected utilities, and other interested persons on the future course of these proceedings until 5:00 p.m. on March 7, 2017.

Finally, because each of these cases is required by Act 341 to be processed as a contested case proceeding, the Commission encourages potential intervenors to begin filing their petitions to intervene in these dockets.

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that:

A. The Commission's Executive Secretary shall electronically serve copies of this order on Consumers Energy Company, DTE Electric Company, Upper Michigan Energy Resources Corporation, Upper Peninsula Power Company, Cloverland Electric Cooperative, Energy Michigan, the Association of Businesses Advocating Tariff Equity, the Retail Energy Supply Association, and on every licensed alternative electric supplier in Michigan.

B. The schedules for the proceedings established for Consumers Energy Company and DTE Electric Company in the January 20, 2017 orders in Case Nos. U-18239 and U-18248, respectively, are suspended as more fully set forth in the order.

C. The Commission Staff, Consumers Energy Company, DTE Electric Company, Upper Michigan Energy Resources Corporation, Upper Peninsula Power Company, Cloverland Electric Cooperative, and other interested persons shall have until 5:00 p.m. on March 7, 2017, to file recommendations in the captioned dockets regarding the scope and the associated schedules for

these proceedings in light of the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission's decision and the potential shift in the focus away from Section 6w(1) towards Section 6w(2) of Act 341 of 2016.

The Commission reserves jurisdiction and may issue further orders as necessary.

MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

Sally A. Talberg, Chairman

Norman J. Saari, Commissioner

Rachael A. Eubanks, Commissioner

By its action of February 28, 2017.

Kavita Kale, Executive Secretary

P R O O F O F S E R V I C E

STATE OF MICHIGAN)

Case No. U-18239 et al.

County of Ingham)

Gloria Pearl Jones being duly sworn, deposes and says that on February 28, 2017 A.D. she electronically notified the attached list of this **Commission Order via e-mail transmission**, to the persons as shown on the attached service list (Listserv Distribution List).

Gloria Pearl Jones

Gloria Pearl Jones

Subscribed and sworn to before me
this 28th day of February 2017

Lisa Felice

Lisa Felice
Notary Public, Eaton County
My Commission Expires April 15, 2020

**CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY, ALTERNATIVE ELECTRIC
SUPPLIER'S, ASSOCIATION OF BUSINESSES ADVOCATING TARIFF
EQUITY, CLOVERLAND ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, DTE ENERGY
COMPANY, ENERGY MICHIGAN, RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY
ASSOCIATION, UPPER MICHIGAN ENERGY RESOURCES
CORPORATION, AND UPPER PENINSULA POWER COMPANY'S
ELECTRONIC DISTRIBUTION LIST
FEBRUARY 28, 2017
CASE NO. U-18239**

michael.torrey@cmsenergy.com

ejschneidewind@varnumlaw.com

jtselecky@consultbai.com

ddasho@cloverland.com

scdevon@uppc.com

kurmass@dteenergy.com

christine.kane@we-energies.com

jheston@fraserlawfirm.com

mkuchera@aepenergy.com

gbass@calpinesolutions.com

timothy.aufdencamp@cmsenergy.com

igoodman@commerceenergy.com

lael.campbell@constellation.com

a.asaro@dillonpower.com

Teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com

bill.hellinghausen@edfenergyservices.com

regulatory@eligoenergy.com

rami.fawaz@poweronecorp.com

mmann@usgande.com

fesmarketpolicies@fes.com

lfriedeman@igsenergy.com

dmartos@libertypowercorp.com

jhdillavou@micamerican.com

regulatory@nordicenergy-us.com

spersaud@plymouthenergy.com

**CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY, ALTERNATIVE ELECTRIC
SUPPLIER'S, ASSOCIATION OF BUSINESSES ADVOCATING TARIFF
EQUITY, CLOVERLAND ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE, DTE ENERGY
COMPANY, ENERGY MICHIGAN, RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY
ASSOCIATION, UPPER MICHIGAN ENERGY RESOURCES
CORPORATION, AND UPPER PENINSULA POWER COMPANY'S
ELECTRONIC DISTRIBUTION LIST
FEBRUARY 28, 2017
CASE NO. U-18239**

bschlansker@premierenergyllc.com

cborr@spartanrenewable.com

chris.hendrix@texasretailenergy.com

Zach.HALKOLA@traxys.com

cborr@wpsci.com

aaron.martin@cmsenergy.com

amy.klaviter@constellation.com

christina.crable@directenergy.com

Bonnie.yurga@directenergy.com

ryan.harwell@directenergy.com

arozenblat@eligoenergy.com

crericha@firstenergycorp.com

cbaird-forristall@midamerican.com

Service List -- Case No. U-18239

Name

Mark Eyster

Kelly Hall

Email Address

eystem@michigan.gov

kelly.hall@cmsenergy.com

Service List -- Case No. U-18248

Name

Jon Christinidis

Mark Eyster

Email Address

christinidisj@dteenergy.com

eystem@michigan.gov

Service List -- Case No. U-18258

Name

Cloverland Electric Cooperative

Email Address

ddasho@cloverland.com

P R O O F O F S E R V I C E

STATE OF MICHIGAN)

Case No. U-18239 ET AL.

County of Ingham)

Gloria Pearl Jones being duly sworn, deposes and says that on January 20, 2017 A.D. she electronically notified the attached list of this **Commission Order (Commission's Own Motion) via e-mail transmission**, to the persons as shown on the attached service list (Listserv Distribution List).

Gloria Pearl Jones
Gloria Pearl Jones

Subscribed and sworn to before me
this 20th day of January 2017

Steven J. Cook

Steven J. Cook
Notary Public, Ingham County, Michigan
As acting in Eaton County
My Commission Expires: April 30, 2018

GEMOTION DISTTRIBUTION SERVICE LIST

IN CASE NOS. U-18239, U-18248, U-18253, U-18254 & U-18258

CBaird-Forristall@MIDAMERICAN.COM	Mid American
david.d.donovan@XCELENERGY.COM	Noble Americas
ddasho@cloverland.com	Cloverland
bmalaski@cloverland.com	Cloverland
vobmgr@UP.NET	Village of Baraga
braukerL@MICHIGAN.GOV	Linda Brauker
info@VILLAGEOFCLINTON.ORG	Village of Clinton
jgraham@HOMWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
mkappler@HOMWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
psimmer@HOMWORKS.ORG	Tri-County Electric Co-Op
aurora@FREEWAY.NET	Aurora Gas Company
frucheyb@DTEENERGY.COM	Citizens Gas Fuel Company
mpscfilings@CMSENERGY.COM	Consumers Energy Company
jim.vansickle@SEMCOENERGY.COM	SEMCO Energy Gas Company
kay8643990@YAHOO.COM	Superior Energy Company
ebrushford@UPPCO.COM	Upper Peninsula Power Company
kerriw@TEAMMIDWEST.COM	Midwest Energy Coop
dave.allen@TEAMMIDWEST.COM	Midwest Energy Coop
meghant@TEAMMIDWEST.COM	Midwest Energy Coop
tharrell@ALGERDELTA.COM	Alger Delta Cooperative
tonya@CECELEC.COM	Cherryland Electric Cooperative
sboeckman@GLENERGY.COM	Great Lakes Energy Cooperative
llopez@LIBERTYPOWERCORP.COM	Liberty Power Delaware (Holdings)
kmarklein@STEPHENSON-MI.COM	Stephson Utilities Department
debbie@ONTOREA.COM	Ontonagon Cnty Rural Elec
sharonkr@PIEG.COM	Presque Isle Electric & Gas Cooperative, INC
dbraun@TECMI.COOP	Thumb Electric
rbishop@BISHOPENERGY.COM	Bishop Energy
mkuchera@BLUESTARENERGY.COM	BlueStar Energy
todd.mortimer@CMSENERGY.COM	CMS Energy
igoodman@COMMERCEENERGY.COM	Commerce Energy
david.fein@CONSTELLATION.COM	Constellation Energy
kate.stanley@CONSTELLATION.COM	Constellation Energy
kate.fleche@CONSTELLATION.COM	Constellation New Energy
mpscfilings@DTEENERGY.COM	DTE Energy
Don.Morgan@DUKE-ENERGY.COM	Duke Energy
john.finnigan@DUKE-ENERGY.COM	Duke Energy
bgorman@FIRSTENERGYCORP.COM	First Energy
vnguyen@MIDAMERICAN.COM	MidAmerican Energy
rarchiba@FOSTEROIL.COM	My Choice Energy
gbass@NOBLESOLUTIONS.COM	Noble American Energy
rabaey@SES4ENERGY.COM	Santana Energy
cborr@WPSCI.COM	Spartan Renewable Energy, Inc. (Wolverine Po
john.r.ness@XCELENERGY.COM	Xcel Energy
cityelectric@ESCANABA.ORG	City of Escanaba
crystalfallsmgr@HOTMAIL.COM	City of Crystal Falls
felicel@MICHIGAN.GOV	Lisa Felice

GEMOTION DISTTRIBUTION SERVICE LIST IN CASE NOS. U-18239, U-18248, U-18253, U-18254 & U-18258

mmann@USGANDE.COM	Michigan Gas & Electric
mpolega@GLADSTONEMI.COM	City of Gladstone
rferguson@INTEGRYSGROUP.COM	Integrys Group
lrgustafson@CMSENERGY.COM	Lisa Gustafson
tahoffman@CMSENERGY.COM	Tim Hoffman
daustin@IGSENERGY.COM	Interstate Gas Supply Inc
krichel@DLIB.INFO	Thomas Krichel
pnewton@BAYCITYMI.ORG	Bay City Electric Light & Power
sbn@LBWL.COM	Lansing Board of Water and Light
jreynolds@MBLP.ORG	Marquette Board of Light & Power
bschlansker@PREMIERENERGYONLINE.COM	Premier Energy Marketing LLC
ttarkiewicz@CITYOFMARSHALL.COM	City of Marshall
d.motley@COMCAST.NET	Doug Motley
blaird@michigan.gov	Dan Blair
nwabuezen1@MICHIGAN.GOV	Nicholas Nwabueze
mpauley@GRANGERNET.COM	Marc Pauley
ElectricDept@PORTLAND-MICHIGAN.ORG	City of Portland
akb@ALPENAPOWER.COM	Alpena Power
dbodine@LIBERTYPOWERCORP.COM	Liberty Power
leew@WVPA.COM	Wabash Valley Power
kmolitor@WPSCI.COM	Wolverine Power
ham557@GMAIL.COM	Lowell S.
AKlaviter@INTEGRYSENERGY.COM	Integrys Energy Service, Inc WPSES
BusinessOffice@REALGY.COM	Realgy Energy Services
landerson@VEENERGY.COM	Volunteer Energy Services
Ldalessandris@FES.COM	First Energy Solutions
rboston@NOBLESOLUTIONS.COM	Noble Energy Solutions
mbarber@HILLSDALEBPU.COM	Hillsdale Board of Public Utilities
mrzwiers@INTEGRYSGROUP.COM	Mich Gas Utilities/Upper Penn Power/Wisconsi
dityler@MICHIGANGASUTILITIES.COM	Mich Gas Utilities/Qwest
donm@BPW.ZEELAND.MI.US	Zeeland Board of Public Works
Teresa.ringenbach@directenergy.com	Direct Energy
christina.crable@directenergy.com	Direct Energy
Bonnie.yurga@directenergy.com	Direct Energy
ryan.harwell@directenergy.com	Direct Energy
kadardwa@itctransco.com	ITC Holdings Corp.
johnbistranin@realgy.com	Realgy Corp.
jweeks@mpower.org	Jim Weeks
gaclark2@aep.com	Indiana Michigan Power Company
mvorabouth@ses4energy.com	Santana Energy
scdevon@upppo.com	Upper Peninsula Power Company
sjwestmoreland@voyager.net	MEGA
hvester@itctransco.com	ITC Holdings